EXPLORING THE IMPLEMENTATION OF TRANSFORMATIONAL LEADERSHIP IN GOVERNMENT, BUSINESS, AND HIGHER EDUCATION ORGANIZATIONS

Made Satria Pramanda Putra [1], I Gede Riana [2], I Wayan Gede Supartha [3] and Agoes Ganesha Rahyuda [4]

[1] Politeknik Negeri Bali.
[2,3,4] Universitas Udayana.
Email: [1]satriapramanda@pnb.ac.id, [2]gederiana@unud.ac.id,
[3]wayangedesupartha@unud.ac.id, [4]agoesgrahyuda@unud.ac.id

Abstract

Purpose – Extensive research on transformational leadership has strongly indicated that the concept of transformational leadership is dynamic and continually evolving, theoretically and practically, up to the present. Therefore, this study aims to explore the implementation of transformational leadership in government, business, and higher education organizations in the Bali Province. **Design/methodology/approach** – This research adopts a grounded theory approach with a theoretical agnosticism perspective and utilizes Phronetic Iterative Qualitative Data Analysis. **Findings –** This study successfully uncovers four dimensions of transformational leadership in government, business, and higher education organizations, namely (1) Inspirational Motivation, (2) Idealized Influence, (3) Iterative Vision, and (4) Developing People. **Originality/value –** Previous studies on transformational leadership have been conducted partially within a specific sector. Using a qualitative approach, this study simultaneously examines the three organizational contexts, namely government, business, and higher education. **Limitation –** The research is limited to three organizational contexts: government organizations, businesses, and higher education institutions in the Bali Province, providing opportunities for future studies to expand contextual development. **Future Research –** Future research can further deepen the study within each organizational context. Additionally, further research can focus on a single organizational context or combine various industries. From a location perspective, this research has geographical limitations. Therefore, future studies can broaden the geographical scope or conduct comparative research in the exact location to facilitate result comparisons.

Keywords: Transformational Leadership, Dimensions, Qualitative Research.

A. INTRODUCTION

Transformational leadership, first introduced by Downton (1973), has undergone rapid development up to the present. During its early emergence, scholars such as Burn (1978), Bass (1985), and Bass and Avolio (1995) made significant contributions to the development of dimensions and measurement of transformational leadership. Bass (1985) expanded on Burns' initial ideas by elucidating how transformational leadership can be measured and its influence on the motivation and performance of followers.

As a cornerstone of the new era of leadership concepts, transformational leadership has generated much research since its introduction nearly fifty years ago. From a broader perspective, this can be viewed from two angles. Firstly, abundant research on transformational leadership suggests that discussions have reached a saturation point or conceptual maturity. On the other hand, the extensive research on transformational leadership serves as valid and absolute evidence that the concept is highly dynamic and continuously evolving, theoretically and practically.

Previous research on transformational leadership was relatively carried out in specific sectors, such as the government sector (Donkor et al., 2021; Ashikali & Groeneveld, 2015); Jun 2017;), private sector (Afsar et al., 2019; Kim et al., 2019; Luo et al., 2019; Jain et al., 2019; Jnaneswar & Ranjit, 2020; Puni et al., 2020) and academic

(Supermane, 2019; Ugwu, 2019; Velarde et al., 2020; Lambrecht et al., 2020). Therefore, this provides a strong foundation for conducting simultaneous research across various sectors such as government organizations, businesses, and academia (Putra, et al., 2023). Hence, conducting research on transformational leadership in the context of Bali Province, a region globally recognized for its cultural richness and uniqueness, strengthens the argument for the urgency of this study. This research is expected to contribute to the ongoing growth and development of the concept of transformational leadership.

B. LITERATURE REVIEW

One of Bass's (1985) significant contributions to developing the transformational leadership concept was his initial proposal of the dimensions of transformational leadership. The idea of the dimensions of transformational leadership was further explored by Bass and Avolio (1995) and became known as the "Four I's." They are as follows: *Idealized Influence* demonstrates how a leader behaves and earns deep trust and confidence from their followers. Transformational leaders are admired by their followers for their adherence to ethical principles in decision-making. They use charisma and charm to influence their followers to believe in and focus on high-level aspirations (Antonakis et al., 2003; Puni et al., 2020). Followers take pride in working with their leader and strongly believe in their leader's ability to address organizational issues. *Inspirational Motivation* is a dimension that showcases a leader's behaviour with a transformational leadership style, the ability to communicate a vision and inspire followers towards advancing organizational goals. This dimension relates to a leader's capacity to inspire followers through communication by providing an appealing and credible vision of the future, ultimately focusing on collective goals in the future (Bass, 1985; Hater & Bass, 1988; Bass & Riggio, 2006).

Intellectual Stimulation is a dimension that reflects a leader's ability to enhance the creativity and innovation of their followers in addressing problems. In this dimension, the leader seeks ideas and input from followers, thus fostering creativity, innovation, and new methods to replace old ways of creatively solving challenges for collective benefit (Puni et al., 2020). *Individualized Consideration* is a leader's behaviour that provides personal attention, treats each subordinate as an individual with different needs, abilities, and aspirations, and provides coaching, feedback, or advice. Individualized consideration in transformational leadership treats each subordinate as an individual, guiding, monitoring, and creating new opportunities for them (Bass, 1985; Bass & Avolio, 1990).

Bass and Avolio (1995) further expanded the development of transformational leadership dimensions by Leithwood et al. (1990, 1994, 2006) in academia. They proposed four main categories for the dimensions of transformational leadership: (1) Setting Direction, which includes building a shared vision, developing consensus on goals, and creating high-performance expectations; (2) Developing People, consisting of individual support, intellectual stimulation, and role modelling of practices and values; (3) Redesigning the Organization, comprising culture, structure, policies, and community relationships; and (4) Managing the Instructional Program, where leadership practices involve providing staff for programs, offering instructional support, monitoring school activities, and safeguarding staff from job disturbances.

Kouzes and Posner (1995; 2002) found that leaders are not defined by a position or status but by a collection of actions and behaviours. These actions or practices guide leaders in achieving performance outcomes that exceed expectations and are fundamental to transformational leadership. Kouzes and Posner identified five components of these practices: (1) challenging the process, (2) inspiring a shared vision, (3) enabling others to act, (4) showing the way, and (5) encouraging the heart. Leithwood et al. (1990, 1994, 2006) developed their dimensions of transformational leadership based on their research in the context of school organizations (academic context). The academic context and transformational leadership are closely related, as we can observe how a leader (teacher) seeks to transform their followers (students). On the other hand, Kouzes and Posner took a different approach through a long-term study spanning nearly 20 years, aiming to find answers to what leaders do when they demonstrate their best performance in various situations.

The dimensions of transformational leadership took time to emerge. When the term "transformational leadership" was first introduced by Downton in 1973, the idea of the "Four I's" dimensions emerged, which led to various studies attempting to complement, explore, and formulate dimensions of transformational leadership in their respective contexts. As outlined earlier, the contributions of research on the dimensions of transformational leadership complement each other in developing the concept of transformational leadership. The common thread running through the proposed dimensions can be traced back to the two dimensions of Idealized Influence and Inspirational Motivation (Bass & Avolio, 1995). These dimensions describe charisma, vision, and how transformational leaders communicate and provide an appealing and trusted portrayal of the future, ultimately focusing on collective goals in the future. These align with the dimension of Setting Direction by Leithwood et al. (1990, 1994, 2006) and inspiring a shared vision by Kouzes and Posner (1995, 2002). The primary meaning conveyed is how transformational leaders build a shared vision, develop consensus on goals, and create higher performance expectations among their followers.

C. METHODS

The research approach employed in this study is grounded theory, adopting the concept of theoretical agnosticism and utilizing the data analysis technique introduced by Tracy (2020), known as Phronetic Iterative Qualitative Data Analysis. The formulated concepts or theories serve as alternative guidelines for examining the research based on previous literature. The population of this study comprises top leaders in government, business, and higher education organizations, drawing upon the triple helix framework proposed by Etzkowitz and Leydesdorff (1995).

To determine whether these leaders meet the criteria as research informants, as indicated by solid indicators of transformational leadership, an assessment was conducted using a questionnaire based on the Multifactor Leadership Questionnaire (MLQ) Form 5x Short (Bass & Avolio, 1995; Northouse, 2011). To enhance the reliability of the study, a two-way assessment was employed, involving self-assessment by the leaders themselves and assessment by their followers. The total number of research informants was 19 leaders, all subjected to in-depth interviews.

D. DISCUSSION

1. Theme 1 Implementation of Transformational Leadership

1.1 Dimension of Transformational Leadership

This study reveals the dimensions of transformational leadership in business, government, and higher education organizations in Bali. The dimensions of transformational leadership are based on how transformational leaders implement their leadership within the research context. The findings of the dimensions of transformational leadership in this study include four dimensions and fourteen indicators of transformational leadership. These dimensions are as follows: (1) Inspirational Motivation (Lead by Example; Accepting Correction; Relevant; Solution); (2) Idealized Influence (Diversity; Equality); (3) Iterative Vision (Direction; Repetition); (4) Developing People (Motivation; Individual Support; Creating Space; Drive Creativity and Innovation; Personal Recognition)

Inspirational Motivation refers to the leader motivating by being a role model. The leader not only gives but also sets an example. Idealized Influence reflects the influential leader who becomes a role model for followers. Iterative Vision refers to how the leader understands the organisation's direction and consistently communicates the vision, mission, and goals to stakeholders. Developing People is about leaders being open and providing space and trust for followers to be creative and innovative, ensuring that the organization remains relevant to current developments. Furthermore, leaders acknowledge the changes or contributions of followers that align with the organization's vision, mission, and goals. The following provides a further description of each dimension.

1) Inspirational Motivation

Inspirational Motivation reflects the transformative leader as an influential leader who is a role model for followers. It is important to emphasize that influence is a critical element of leadership, including transformational leadership. With influence, it is nearly possible for leaders to optimize various organizational resources.

This study has revealed that the influence of a transformational leader does not occur instantly. Transformational leaders create and maintain their influence through a consistent and continuous process. As a result of this research, four indicators have been identified that contribute to the strong influence of a transformational leader, inspiring their followers. These four indicators are: (1) Lead by Example, (2) Accepting Correction, (3) Relevant, and (4) Solution. Each of these indicators will be described as follows.

a) Lead by Example

Transformational leadership is about giving and being an example. It means that a leader is not limited to just setting an example but also needs to embody it. A leader must lead by example for their followers. As clearly expressed, firm and straightforward in the interview quote from informant A4:

"I convey that I have to be an example. I never give examples. I am the example." *(Informant A4, 2022).*

Leading by example involves exemplifying attitudes, behaviours, thoughts, and everything one wants to see in their members or followers. Moreover, a leader who

sets an example encourages their followers to reach higher levels or standards and tangibly demonstrates those levels in their everyday leadership within the organization. In this dimension, a leader becomes a role model for their followers. Transformational leadership is about aligning what is said and what is done, and their followers acknowledge this. Being an example is an effort by transformational leaders to actualize the desired qualities they want to replicate within their ranks. The interview quotes from informants A3, A4, and A5 demonstrate this.

"In leading, I set an example, considering all friends; I do not want the ideal relationship between lecturers and students to be synonymous with students always being wrong. I am very open, rarely angry, and I invite dialogue." (Informant A3, 2022).

"What I convey is that I have to be an example. I never give examples. I am an example. I used to be the laziest to go to campus because I had to work outside. At that time, the leader reprimanded me. No. Before the rector finished speaking, I said I was ready. I had to go to Flores, land at Dwijendra, and work on WhatsApp with Bu Rector in the car. If there is someone like that now, they can work outside as long as there is an assignment letter." (Informant A4, 2022).

"To foster trust, we must fulfil our duties to the best of our ability. Here, I will give an example. There is research, friends; please do research. I also do research. I am also a lecturer. There are also duties in the tri dharma. I do them. I manage PPDIKTI in Mahaganesha; I do it myself. To set a good example in filling out BKD, I must master the system. Once I master the system, I can set an example for my friends. Please gather performance data; I have done it a week earlier. The way is to be an example." (Informant A5, 2022).

"Yesterday, I rearranged the tables in my laboratory. They will work harder because I also get involved. They get motivated themselves, and in the end, they join in. I encourage everyone to complete their responsibilities." (Informant A5, 2022).

Leading by example makes the transformational leader a walking showcase. The leader's willingness to actively bear the burden consciously and sincerely by giving and being an example is a clear statement that the transformational leader values every follower's work. Ultimately, this fosters a sense of ownership, engagement, and high support from the followers. Transformational leaders are strong role models for their followers (Northouse, 2007). Followers recognize the presence of transformational leadership as their icon and passionately strive to become similar individuals. Transformational leaders have high moral values and strong ethics consistently reflected in their behaviour, as revealed by informants B4, B5, P2, and P7.

"Be a role model first to get there. Tomorrow, you must arrive on time, leaders we have to be early, they are watching us. What we do should be an example. The characteristic of leadership is a positive influence. In my opinion, a simple principle is that we have a positive influence to influence others. They believe that I am on the right boat with the right captain. Why is influence important? We will have reliable employees, we can sleep peacefully, and we are reliable to them." (Informant B4, 2022).

"There is desire, there is pleasure. When I walk around, I quickly notice good things. I have a clear vision. Even without pictures, I can communicate with guests. Everything becomes eye-catching. We are used to it because it has become a habit as a

housekeeper. It is in our blood. I can even move pots at night because I enjoy it; I consider it brain therapy. We have to live it. We must set an example, provide understanding, and even teach how to sweep. Lead by example." (Informant B5, 2022).

"It is easy and simple; we should not give examples but be the example. If we give examples, we provide theories. If we become the example, we take action. Once we have done it, they will follow what we do. Because what we convey is the result. Sometimes, when we present theories, they think it is just theory. This is what we do." (Informant P2, 2022).

"Every Monday, there is a gathering through a WhatsApp group. Moreover, I set an example. I came early. Now, we have to set examples frequently. Moreover, I have to fill in all the gaps. Ready to back up. I return to eagerness. Enjoy the activities first." (Informant P7, 2022).

The alignment between thoughts, words, and actions demonstrated by leaders in their examples fosters trust from their followers. Trust is the foundation of influence in leadership. Trust and influence grow and develop as the leader consistently serves as a role model for their followers. As a result, followers work under the guidance of transformational leaders to achieve organizational goals.

b) Accepting Correction

Transformational leaders are open to input, aspirations, and corrections directed towards them. Besides being a role models for their followers through the demonstrated alignment, transformational leaders are individuals with a generous spirit. Being at the pinnacle of an organization with all the authority and power does not make a transformational leader resistant or allergic to feedback. This is evident in the interview quotes from informants B2 and P3 as follows:

"When we are sincere, trust exists. Once there is trust, everyone will engage in the business. If I make a mistake, I apologize." (Informant B2, 2022)

"I am always learning. When I make a mistake, it should not be repeated. I have to find that mistake. Even what is already correct should be reevaluated. Tomorrow has to be better. Alternatively, what is effective today will surely be even more effective tomorrow. That is what I always hold on to. I am always grateful." (Informant P3, 2022)

Assuming the role of a leader in an organization does not imply that people expect the leader to be flawless, without any faults or mistakes. However, in transformational leadership, the emphasis is on something other than the direction where the leader loses respect or influence from their followers when a mistake occurs. The emphasis lies in the leader's self-awareness that they are fallible human beings who are highly likely to make mistakes despite efforts to minimize them. A transformational leader is a noble knight who acknowledges their mistakes and learns (evaluates) from them.

Transformational leaders recognize the importance of having a generous spirit and being aware of mistakes, promptly acknowledging them. This enables everyone to focus on finding solutions rather than dwelling on problems (and who should be blamed). By being open, transformational leaders minimize the blame culture, freeing up time and energy for everyone to contribute to problem-solving. Leaders acknowledge mistakes and take steps to rectify or minimize the damage immediately. As a result, followers notice and observe how their leader reacts to a mistake.

Transformational leaders optimize learning opportunities from every action, transforming negative and positive experiences into lessons and breakthroughs. With this element, the likelihood of leaders repeating mistakes becomes minimal compared to leaders who are closed off by high ego walls. Furthermore, solutions or ideas stemming from a leader's mistakes can lead to tremendous organisational success.

c) Relevant

Transformational leaders are agents of change. The expectation is that the changes that occur will align with the established plans or even surpass the targets. However, in practice, the world is constantly evolving and not static. Changes continue to happen, which means that the approaches that worked in the past may not necessarily be applicable in the present or future. Transformational leaders are aware of this vital point. They believe staying relevant to the current circumstances is critical to inspiring, influencing, and guiding the organization on the right path.

Remaining relevant is crucial for transformational leaders. Therefore, channels of information and aspirations become the key to the organization's operational success. Once again, information is the cornerstone of decision-making. Ideally, the richer the information and the more accurate the input the leader receives, the more precise the decisions made. Conversely, a lack of information or errors in obtaining up-to-date information can lead to different decisions that impact the organization's sustainability.

This research has revealed that transformational leaders portray themselves as sponges that absorb various information before making decisions, especially strategic decisions related to monumental changes or the organization's continuity. As disclosed in the interview with informant A1:

"In my leadership, I always emphasize to my staff that as a leader, when making important decisions, I must and should listen to input from all staff members or the structural hierarchy if time does not permit involving everyone. Moreover, I communicate extensively with the deputy rector to provide all the necessary information because, in my understanding of decision-making, the right information is the best decision. Accurate information is the primary tool for making the right decisions." (Informant A1, 2022)

Leaders who remain relevant and data-driven can even solve problems that have yet to arise. This means that by consistently maintaining their relevance, including that of their followers, transformational leaders are always a few steps ahead when making decisions based on trends and identifying the most suitable solutions to issues. This dimension is about leaders who remain relevant to the situation and are not constrained by the shadows of past glory. Followers with diverse backgrounds and stakeholders who observe how a leader strives to stay connected to the current world and the future make transformational leaders an inspiration.

d) Solution

To inspire followers, being a problem solver is integral to being a transformational leader. Transformational leaders are capable of breaking through obstacles in every emerging problem. They are solution-oriented within the organization. To achieve this, imagination is needed to break through organizational challenges. To be solution-oriented, transformational leaders are individuals full of creativity, which is the core of innovation and change. Transformational leaders approach problems with creative solutions, find innovative ways to lead and develop teams, recognize talent in

unexpected places, and visualize what the organization may face far into the future. As revealed in the interviews with informants B5, A4, and A1:

"When I walk around, I quickly notice good things. I have a clear vision. Even without pictures, I can communicate with guests. Everything becomes eye-catching. Because it has become a habit as a housekeeper, we are already accustomed to it. It is ingrained in us. Even at night, I can move a pot just because I feel like it. I consider it as brain therapy." (Informant B5, 2022)

"If I were the first to make a system change, anything done on this campus must be by system and design, no longer incidental. For example, I wanted our campus to no longer be a supported university, especially in community service, so I had to make changes. To make changes, I could not do it my way. I looked at what is needed in the system to change the supported status to a division. I saw that we were capable of that. I invited the Dean and Program Heads to the Research and Community Service Institute and said, 'This is what we will do to bring about change.' Secondly, before 2019, Our Campus ranking needed to be clearer in student affairs because it was based on something other than a system. It needed to be filled. So, when I became rector, I opened its development. WR 3 is now the standard. I called the academic bureau and asked, 'What is the content of the student guidebook?' Let us open it and print it for me. It was there. In one year, the ranking became clear. It ranked 600, unlike before. Then I saw that it was very dynamic. Two years ago, it ranked 113." (Informant A4, 2022)

"There are many staff members that I had to take out of their comfort zones. So, these staff members were not recruited; they were already here. Changing mindsets because change happens is the biggest challenge. It is challenging to bring the existing staff members to the futuristic vision and mission, even though we agreed on the vision and mission together. However, it has to be revolutionary; otherwise, why would we change?" (Informant A1, 2022)

Transformational leaders can address unexpected problems with creative solutions, find innovative ways to lead and develop teams, recognize talent in unexpected places, and visualize what their organization may face far into the future.

2) Idealized Influnce

A transformational leader responds to individual differences within an organization as something normal and natural. This awareness is demonstrated by accepting the differences that exist. A transformational leader does not see differences as weaknesses but as strengths and challenges to help individuals improve. Understanding and embracing differences as challenges is the initial step for a transformational leader to foster development. Recognizing that each individual has different characteristics further enhances the enthusiasm of a transformational leader to encourage their followers to reach higher levels.

Another element of human resource development in transformational leadership is the presence of justice. Fairness is critical to leadership. Leaders who practice fair management will steer the organization on a solid path and distance it from issues that arise from the absence of justice.

This was revealed in an interview with informant B3, who stated the following:

"Success cannot be measured from one aspect alone. There are many aspects. Being successful in business but not in other areas means nothing. I have my family; they are all here. Throughout my journey from 2004 until now, I have endeavored to manage justice to prevent divisions." (Informant B3, 2022)

A leader who exhibits fairness is someone who can act justly and provide equal opportunities and treatment for all members of their team. Justice is vital within an organization. Without justice, conflicts can arise both horizontally and vertically within the organization. Equality and equal opportunities for team members to grow are critical to human resource development.

3) Iterative Vision

Iterative Vision is how leaders understand the organization's direction and continuously communicate the vision, mission, and goals to stakeholders. The organization's vision and mission are a reference for transformational leaders in leading their teams. Transformational leaders use the organization's vision and mission as guidance to ensure the organization is kept in its direction amidst ongoing changes. Therefore, transformational leaders believe that the agreed-upon vision and mission of the organization should not be mere words displayed on the organization's walls or artifacts. The organization's vision and mission must penetrate and resonate with every member. This study reveals two indicators that maintain the organization's direction and establish the vision and mission as a solid foundation. These indicators are (1) Direction and (2) Repetition.

Transformational leaders can inspire and motivate their followers by possessing a clear vision and effectively conveying it. A successful transformational leader easily inspires their followers through clarity. They convince their followers through simple and easily understood words and their demeanor (Northouse, 2007). This dimension is evident from the interviews with informants B5, B2, and B4, as follows:

"When I walk around, I quickly notice the good things. I have a clear vision. Even without pictures, I can communicate with guests." (Informant B5, 2022).

"I can visualize who I am working with." (Informant B2, 2022).

"My strength lies in knowing and understanding when to apply an adaptive management system when to be tough and accommodating. We need a time-based approach, knowing when to tolerate and not to. To develop people, we need to motivate them." (Informant B4, 2022).

"There is desire, there is pleasure. When I walk around, I quickly notice the good things. I have a clear vision. Even without pictures, I can communicate with guests. Everything becomes eye-catching. We are accustomed to it because it has become a housekeeper habit. It is ingrained in us. Even at night, I can move a pot because I enjoy it. I consider it brain therapy." (Informant B5, 2022).

The organization's vision and mission are a reference for transformational leaders in leading their teams. Transformational leaders use the organization's vision and mission as guidance to ensure the organization is kept in its direction amidst ongoing changes. Therefore, transformational leaders believe that the agreed-upon vision and mission of the organization should not be mere words or decorations.

The power of repetition is a leader's best friend. Repeating oneself may initially seem disruptive, but ensuring that followers deliver and receive the message is essential. The power of repetition is an essential tool for any leader to achieve the desired outcomes within their team. The power of repetition requires more skill in finding various creative and effective ways to convey the same ideas to followers. Repetition can start with repeating the message differently, appreciating understanding, leading by example, and becoming a role model. As revealed in the interviews with informants A1 and P2, as follows:

"And I come back to the issue of staff, how they can follow what we do, the subtle strategic approach by providing a lot, just like flight attendants, repeating, we become the center of innovation, so repetition, the center of innovation. We must create a good strategic plan; this is what we must do so that by 2045, we will achieve what we convey. On various occasions, I always say, innovation, innovation, so we must have a motto and values, so this campus, because it must have a good acronym, our motto became BALI." (Informant A1, 2022).

"Easy and simple, we should not give examples, we should be the example. If we give an example, we provide a theory. If we become the example, we take action. If we have taken action, they will follow what we do. Because what we convey is the result." (Informant P2, 2022).

Repetition in leadership is one of the easiest ways to address miscommunication and communication disruptions. This is because repetition enhances the clarity of intentions and desired goals. Repeating tasks more than once, reiterating statements when they seem unclear, or returning to unanswered questions are examples of using repetition to strengthen communication and collaboration. The power of repetition is not only about fixing problems. It can also help leaders when they want to praise and reward their team or followers. Ideally, the most meaningful praise for followers comes from the leader rather than from customers or colleagues. In the context of appreciation, repetition makes praise or recognition stick to the followers and, over time, boosts their self-confidence.

Intensive repetition becomes a cornerstone of transformational leadership. Once again, transformational leadership is about change. Therefore, creating a recurring cycle of where the organization is headed becomes deeply ingrained in the followers. In the future, followers will remember what has been conveyed. Moreover, when repetition is done by setting an example, it gives even more strength to the idea.

4) *Developing People*

Developing People means that a leader is progressive, encouraging change in their followers that aligns with the organization while recognizing the diversity of backgrounds and differences in followers' abilities. This dimension focuses on providing attention related primarily to personal giving, paying attention to and treating each employee individually. Leaders give special attention to their followers' needs, achievements, and growth in this context. This study reveals five indicators of the developing people dimension, which are as follows: (1) Motivation; (2) Individual Support; (3) Creating Space; (4) Driving Creativity and Innovation; (5) Personal Recognition. The description of each of these five indicators is as follows.

a) Motivation

Transformational leadership provides a supportive climate for its followers. In this regard, leaders carefully listen to each individual's needs. Transformational leaders act as coaches and advisors to assist their followers in performing their tasks. They help followers overcome personal challenges by using delegation. This equation contributes to the professional development of followers, which benefits the organization in the future. Transformational leaders uniquely nurture each follower (Northouse, 2007). They treat each individual differently to meet their expectations and aspirations. This helps followers exert maximum effort to achieve organizational success.

One distinguishing dimension that shows a substantial difference between transformational leadership and other contemporary leadership theories is Individual Consideration. Bass (1985) revealed that individual consideration occurs when a leader has a developmental orientation towards the staff, demonstrates individual attention to followers, and responds appropriately to their needs. Individual Consideration is the extent to which a leader pays attention to each follower's needs and serves as a mentor, coach, or guide. These leaders listen to the concerns and needs of each follower and provide support and empathy towards each person's situation and background.

When leaders demonstrate individual consideration, they also recognize the unique talents that each follower brings to the workplace and support them in developing and showcasing their skills. This directs followers to aspire for further growth and exhibit greater motivation in their work. As expressed by informants B5 and B4:

"For our discussions, I attend regularly because when I was a staff, my condition was rarely asked. For example, whether you feel comfortable working here or the workload I give you has any issues. My previous leader rarely did that. The leader always remembers to assign tasks but never asks about the conditions experienced by the staff. Rarely. I asked them one by one, but it was never scheduled. In official meetings, we follow our job descriptions. I feel uncomfortable with their teamwork; they cannot share their stories. They only shared with me. I do it routinely. When I observe their gestures, I call them and ask about their obstacles. We address and anticipate them. In the past, I was never asked how I was doing." (Informant A5, 2022).

"I agree that we are not building a business but building people. If we build a business without being prepared with the people, it will not progress. The key is empathy. Once we decide on someone to join us, we must allocate time to develop them with empathy. We evaluate the person, whether they are honest or not. We spare more time for them." (Informant B4, 2022).

b) Individual Support

This research found that transformational leaders do not personally reduce their subordinates. Transformational leaders focus on the progressive improvement of their followers, as revealed in the following statement from informant B3 during the interview:

"During my tenure in several companies, I have never fired an employee. Some employees were not performing well, and they resigned. I have never fired anyone. I always invite them to have meals together. I have been doing this for a long time." (Informant B3, 2022)

The above interview quote indicates that, at some point, transformational leaders support their followers even when they do not wish to continue their cooperation with the organization. Transformational leaders fully support their followers' talents and hope they can improve themselves, even outside the organization.

c) Creating Space

Transformational leaders create space for their followers to contribute to the organization. Organizations can survive, grow, and thrive by finding better ways to do what the organization already excels at. To discover this, channels and room for radical ideas to emerge and receive attention are necessary. As revealed in the interviews with informants B1, B4, and B5:

"Professionally, in running a business, a restaurant. I truly give people opportunities to develop; I give them a chance to provide input to be creative; I give all that but under control. So far, it has been successful." (Informant B1, 2022).

"Then, honesty. Our culture teaches management principles. If they make a plan, it should not be excessive but should have a maximum impact they are confident in achieving. I teach them to set achievable targets and not to aim too high. Through honesty, improvement can be achieved." (Informant B4, 2022).

"If subordinates have ideas, of course, we accept them. The more ideas there are, the more we filter and appreciate them, thus creating a sense of belonging. When their ideas are implemented, they will be pleased." (Informant B5, 2022).

Creating sufficient space to accommodate ideas from each individual within the organization is a particular concern in implementing transformational leadership. The informants' reflections indicate that transformational leaders highly value the ideas that flow through the channels and spaces created within the organization. However, the space provided is mild and with rules. The leaders still maintain control and adhere to applicable guidelines. This indicator pertains to the belief of transformational leaders that empowering human resources is essential to bring about monumental change within the organization. Leaders' primary focus is to create space for the entry of creative ideas from various sources.

d) *Drive Creativity and Innovation*

The existence of idea spaces within organizations is expected to generate extraordinary ideas from everyone. Creativity is the tendency to generate or recognize ideas, alternatives, or possibilities helpful in solving problems. This indicator is revealed through the interviews with informants B1, B2, and B5.

"First is the sense of ownership. For example, when determining the menu, we already have standard menus. However, through employee participation, I usually organize a competition. Every employee has to create a menu that they can make. Later, we select menus that make sense and are feasible for our restaurant, and we test them. We conduct food tests. We give them a bonus if the menu gets included in our list. They are proud to see their menu on the list. Money motivation is certainly there. However, the question is how to earn money, whether it is enough from the salary or if they want more through creativity." (Informant B1, 2022).

"Everyone understands how to be creative. Even in organizing events, we are given the freedom, and it turns out to be more creative than being required to do this and that." (Informant B2, 2022).

"After I focused a lot on the inn because we are professionals, I have worked in a star-rated hotel, so I know guests' expectations. With our capabilities, we have come a long way financially. We exercise creativity. People often comment that our garden is beautiful and genuinely mean it. Creativity does not need a large capital. Just arranging things on our own is enough." (Informant B5, 2022).

Transformational leaders encourage their followers to become more creative by stimulating them to be more creative and innovative, challenging their beliefs and values regarding the organization. This also supports followers in experimenting with new ideas that bring about change within an organization.

e) *Personal Recognition*

This study demonstrates a strong connection between transformational and transactional leadership dimensions, expressly contingent rewards. Bass (1995) praised the work completed successfully, provided recommendations for salary increases and promotions, and praised excellent efforts, all contingent rewards.

Negotiation over rewards based on target fulfillment between leaders and followers is a form of transactional leadership. In contrast to transactional leadership, transformational leaders reward followers based on their performance, which represents a change in the individual followers that aligns with the organization's vision, mission, and goals. This is evident from the information obtained from informant A4, who stated:

"I want to be better than before. I am heavy, providing incentives. Our campus is small, and the budget is limited, not wealthy. However, I am willing to spend money. Anyone who completes their Ph.D., I gave them 10 million at the beginning. For those who graduate, I give additional incentives." (Informant A4, 2022)

The reflection of the informant shows how leaders appreciate their followers who seek transformation within themselves. In this context, transformation takes the form of acquiring knowledge through formal education. These followers' actions align with and support the organization's overall performance. Implementing this in an organization instills a strong assumption in followers' minds that consistent contributions aligned with the organization's vision and mission will be recognized and rewarded. Recognition of followers is revealed in the interview quotes from informants P5 and B4:

"This has been my driving force for 3.5 years. My friends responded, and their response was incredible. When they do that, I give them rewards, no matter how small. For example, one of my staff made a natural waste bin using bamboo, and I announced it during our meeting. It was in the governor's presence who issued the policy of plastic-free Bali. BPBD Bali goes to green. One of the actions was making a natural waste bin. The reward was simple: I gave them a traditional headband to wear on Thursdays, the "wanita kamen." For my staff, especially in public, it brings them tremendous happiness." (Informant P5, 2022)

"The key is to be sincere in recognizing them, not fake. I mean, if they do something good, recognize it. When something good is recognized, it will be repeated. It is easy to appreciate them for doing good. The monetary mechanism is a different story. However, the main thing is to recognize them sincerely. Guests are human, and employees are human, too. Employees can tell if the boss is fake or sincere. Moreover, never think that our employees do not know. Because they are the ones we teach

about serving guests. Their psychology knows because they know." (Informant B4, 2022)

This study uses the term "Personal Recognition" to conceptually explain the recognition given by transformational leaders. Personal Recognition occurs when leaders acknowledge followers' efforts aligning with the organization's vision, mission processes, achievements, and goals.

1.2 Synthesis of Transformational Leadership Dimensions

The dimension of Inspirational Motivation highlights a leader's behaviour who can communicate a vision and inspire their followers towards the progress of organizational goals. This dimension is related to a leader's capacity to inspire followers through communication by providing an appealing, credible, and ultimately focused portrayal of a collective future goal (Bass, 1985; Hater & Bass, 1988; Bass & Riggio, 2006). Inspirational Motivation is characterized by the leader's enthusiasm, optimism, motivation, and the ability to challenge others (Bass & Riggio, 2006). This dimension revolves around a transformational leader who is enthusiastic and optimistic and motivates and inspires their followers by presenting them with challenges.

This study reveals the dimension of transformational leadership using a similar term as used by Bass (1985, 1998): Inspirational Motivation. Leaders encourage their followers by serving as role models showcasing their qualities and capabilities. The difference from the qualities presented by Bass and Riggio (2006) lies in the four qualities of a transformational leader, namely (1) leading by example, (2) accepting correction, (3) relevance, and (4) providing solutions.

The analysis of participant reflections revealed that transformational leaders are more than just inspiring their followers through communication by providing an appealing portrayal of the future, as expressed by Bass (1985, 1998). This study demonstrates that transformational leaders also directly engage by setting a real-life example in front of their followers. Thus, leaders become walking showcases. This walking showcase can be interpreted as a situation where followers clearly and explicitly understand what and how to perform specific actions. This quality is balanced with a broad-mindedness to accept corrections and strive to remain relevant to the latest developments. Ultimately, inspiring followers is about how leaders can provide or create solutions.

The dimension of Idealized Influence represents a leader's behaviour in earning deep trust and confidence from their followers (Bass & Avolio, 1995). Transformational leaders are admired by their followers for their commitment to ethical principles in decision-making. The qualities of a leader in the Idealized Influence dimension include being a risk-taker, ethical, and a role model (Bass & Riggio, 2006). Although using a similar term to Bass and Riggio (2006), Idealized Influence, this study reveals different qualities of leaders compared to previous literature. Leadership is indeed about influence. To exert influence, transformational leaders begin by understanding the differences among their followers and upholding a sense of justice. Both of these aspects are vital, considering that the influence exerted by a leader is on human beings and not machines or programmed robots. A leader who understands individual differences will adopt the appropriate influence for a specific individual at a particular moment. Furthermore, emphasis on justice minimizes conflicts by implementing justice-based policies.

Leithwood et al. (1990, 1994, 2006) identified Developing People as one of the dimensions of transformational leadership, consisting of three components: individual support, intellectual stimulation, and role modelling of practices and values. This study makes some adjustments to the qualities that emerge within the dimension of developing people, particularly in how leaders pave the way for creativity and innovation. Another strategic indicator is the recognition of individual achievements aligned with the organization's interests.

2. Theme II: Comparison of Transformational Leadership Dimensions

The study identified four dimensions of transformational leadership: (1) Inspirational Motivation, (2) Idealized Influence, (3) Iterative Vision, and (4) Developing People. Further analysis revealed that all four dimensions of transformational leadership were present in the three organizational contexts. All dimensions of transformational leadership emerged in all three organizational contexts. However, a deeper analysis of the research data indicated that the dimension of idealized influence received greater emphasis in government organizations. As known, government organizations have unique characteristics, particularly in terms of human resources. Various human resources policies such as recruitment, development, and termination can be carried out more freely in organizations outside the government sector. In government organizations, specific mechanisms must be followed for incoming and existing human resources.

The given and rigid nature of human resources in government organizations compared to other organizations makes transformational leaders emphasize the values of individual differences within the organization. Transformational leaders in government organizations understand the diverse backgrounds of their human resources. A strong understanding of these differences enables leaders to act as conductors who can achieve harmonization by empowering and increasing the productivity of their subordinates. On the other hand, the dimension of iterative vision receives emphasis in the context of universities. Vision refers to a long-term perspective of the future and what will be achieved. Unlike businesses with different visions depending on the type of enterprise and stakeholders' desires, university leaders have a clear direction and purpose in life and career. As educational organizations, universities primarily focus on one main goal: to enhance the quality of human resources, particularly students, with various available resources. The presence of a clear and firm vision in the educational context has helped leaders create clear and decisive action plans and motivate followers to work hard and innovate to achieve the goals. These efforts are repeated over time until they become ingrained in the minds of all organisation members. This alignment between the members' aspirations and the organization's vision is established.

E. CONCLUSION

This research successfully revealed four dimensions of transformational leadership in government organizations, businesses, and universities in Bali. These dimensions are (1) Inspirational Motivation, (2) Idealized Influence, (3) Iterative Vision, and (4) Developing People. Inspirational Motivation refers to a leader motivating by being a role model. The leader not only gives but also sets an example. Idealized Influence reflects the influential leader who becomes a role model for followers. Iterative Vision involves how a leader understands the organisation's direction and continuously

communicates the vision, mission, and goals to stakeholders. Developing People emphasizes the leader's openness by providing space and trust for followers to be creative and innovative, thus enabling the organization to stay relevant to current developments. Furthermore, the leader acknowledges the changes or contributions of followers that align with the organization's vision, mission, and goals.

F. LIMITATIONS AND FUTURE RECOMMENDATIONS

The limited context of this study, focusing on three organizational contexts, namely government, business, and higher education, provides room for future research to further develop within these contexts. Future research can delve deeper into each specific context explored in this study. Future research can also focus on a single organizational context or combine various industries. In terms of geographical perspective, this research has limitations as it was conducted in the province of Bali. Future research can expand the scope to include different locations or conduct the study in the exact location to compare research findings.

References

1) Afsar, B., Masood, M. and Umrani, W.A. 2019. The role of job crafting and knowledge sharing on the effect of transformational leadership on innovative work behavior. Personnel Review, 48 (5), 1186-1208. https://doi.org/10.1108/PR-04-2018-0133.

2) Antonakis, J., Avolio, B.J. and Sivasubramaniam, N. 2003. Context and leadership: an examination of the nine-factor full-range leadership theory using the multifactor leadership questionnaire. *The Leadership Quarterly*, 14 (3), 261-295.

3) Ashikali, T. and Groeneveld, S. 2015. Diversity Management in Public Organizations and Its Effect on Employees Affective Commitment: The Role of Transformational Leadership and the Inclusiveness of the Organizational Culture. *Review of Public Personnel Administration*, 35(2), 146–168. doi: 10.1177/0734371X13511088.

4) Bass, B. M. 1985. *Leadership and performance beyond expectations.* New York: Free Press.

5) Bass BM 1998. Transformational Leadership. Industrial, Military, and Educational Impact. Mahwah. NJ: LEA.

6) Bass, B. M., & Avolio, B. J. 1995. The Multifactor Leadership Questionnaire. Palo Alto, CA: Mind Garden.

7) Bass, B.M. and Riggio, R.E. 2006. *Transformational Leadership.* Lawrence Erlbaum Associates, Mahawah, NJ.

8) Burns, J. M. 1978. Leadership. New York: Harper & Row.

9) Donkor, F., Appienti, W.A. & Achiaah, E. 2021. The Impact of Transformational Leadership Style on Employee Turnover Intention in State-Owned Enterprises in Ghana. The Mediating Role of Organisational Commitment. *Public Organiz Rev* https://doi.org/10.1007/s11115-021-00509-5.

10) Downton, J. V. 1973. Rebel leadership: Commitment and charisma in a revolutionary. New York: Free Press.

11) Etzkowitz, Henry & Leydesdorff, Loet (1995). The Triple Helix-University-Industry-Government Relations: A Laboratory for Knowledge Based Economic Development. Rochester, NY. SSRN 2480085.

12) Hater, J.J. and Bass, B.M. 1988. Superiors' evaluations and subordinates' perceptions of transformational and transactional leadership. Journal of Applied Psychology, 73 (4), 695-702.

13) Jain, P., Duggal, T. and Ansari, A.H. 2019. Examining the mediating effect of trust and psychological well-being on transformational leadership and organizational commitment. Benchmarking: An International Journal, 26 (5), 1517-1532. https://doi.org/10.1108/BIJ-07-2018-0191.

14) Jnaneswar dan Ranjit, G. 2020, Effect of transformational leadership on job performance: testing the mediating role of corporate social responsibility. Journal of Advances in Management Research, 17(5), 605-625. https://doi.org/10.1108/JAMR-05-2020-0068.

15) Jun, Soo Young. 2017. The Mediating Effect of Social Capital on the Relationship Between Public Health Managers' Transformational Leadership and Public Health Nurses' Organizational Empowerment in Korea Public Health. Asian Nursing Research, 11 (4), 246-252. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.anr.2017.08.006.

16) Kim Byung-Jik, Sungjin Park & Tae-Hyun Kim. 2019. The effect of transformational leadership on team creativity: sequential mediating effect of employee's psychological safety and creativity. Asian Journal of Technology Innovation, 27(1), 90-107, DOI: 10.1080/19761597.2019.1587304.

17) Kouzes, J.M. & Posner, B.Z. 1995. *The Leadership Challenge: How to Keep Getting Extraordinary Things Done in Organizations*. San Francisco, CA: Jossey-Bass.

18) Kouzes, J.M. & Posner, B.Z. 2002. *Leadership Challenge, 3rd ed.* San Francisco, CA: Jossey-Bass.

19) Lambrecht Jennifer, Jenny Lenkeit, Anne Hartmann, Antje Ehlert, Michel Knigge & Nadine Spörer. 2020. The effect of school leadership on implementing inclusive education: how transformational and instructional leadership practices affect individualised education planning. International Journal of Inclusive Education. DOI: 10.1080/13603116.2020.1752825.

20) Leithwood, K., Begley, P., & Cousins, B. 1990. The nature, causes and consequences of principals' practices: An agenda for future research. *Journal of Educational Administration*, 28 (4), 5–31.

21) Leithwood, K. 1994. The move towards transformational leadership. *Educational Leadership*, 49 (5), 8–12.

22) Leithwood, K., Day, C., Sammons, P., Harris, A., & Hopkins, D. 2006. *Seven strong claims about successful school leadership.* Nottingham: National College of School Leadership.

23) Luo Anqi, Priyanko Guchait, Lindsey Lee, Juan M. Madera.2019. Transformational leadership and service recovery performance: The mediating effect of emotional labor and the influence of culture. International Journal of Hospitality Management, 77, 31-39. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.ijhm.2018.06.011.

24) Northouse, P. G. 2007. Leadership theory and practice (4th ed.). Sage Publications,

25) Northouse, P. 2011. Introduction to leadership: Concept and Practice. Thousand Oaks, CA: Sage Publications.

26) Puni, A., Hilton, S.K. and Quao, B. 2020. The interaction effect of transactional-transformational leadership on employee commitment in a developing country, Management Research Review, 44 (3), 399-417, https://doi.org/10.1108/MRR-03-2020-0153

27) Putra, M. S. P., Riana, I. G., & Ketut, D., Agoes Ganesha. 2023. Being A Transformational Leader: An Integrated Review And Future Research Agenda. The Seybold Report, 18 (2), 2186-2205. DOI 10.17605/OSF.IO/TBXFY

28) Supermane, S. 2019. Transformational leadership and innovation in teaching and learning activities: the mediation effect of knowledge management. Information Discovery and Delivery, 47(4), 242-250. https://doi.org/10.1108/IDD-05-2019-0040.

29) Tracy, Sarah J.. 2020. Qualitative research methods: collecting evidence, crafting analysis, communicating impact. Wiley Blackwell.

30) Ugwu, C. I. 2019. Mediation effect of knowledge management on the relationship between transformational leadership and job performance of librarians in university libraries in Nigeria. Journal of Librarianship and Information Science, 51(4), 1052–1066. doi: 10.1177/0961000618763715.

31) Velarde, J. M., Ghani, M. F., Adams, D., & Cheah, J.-H. 2020. Towards a healthy school climate: The mediating effect of transformational leadership on cultural intelligence and organisational health. Educational Management Administration & Leadership. https://doi.org/10.1177/1741143220937311.